

April 18, 2012

2550 M Street, NW Washington, DC 20037-1350 202-457-6000

Facsimile 202-457-6315 www.pattonboggs.com

FILED/ACCEPTED

APR 18 2012

Federal Communications Commission
Office of the Secretary

Monica S. Desai Direct Tel: 202-457-7535 Direct Fax: 202-457-6315 mdesai@pattonboggs.com

Ms. Marlene H. Dortch Secretary

Federal Communications Commission 445 Twelfth Street, S.W. Washington, DC 20554 ORIGINAL

Re:

Windy City Cellular, LLC Updated Redacted - For Public Inspection Version of Petition for Waiver in WC Docket Nos. 10-90, 07-135, 05-337 and 03-109; CC Docket Nos. 01-92 and 96-45; WT Docket No. 10-208; GN Docket No. 09-51

Dear Ms. Dortch:

On Tuesday, April 3, 2012, Windy City Cellular, LLC ("WCC") filed a Petition for Waiver with a Request for Confidentiality for certain exhibits and an accompanying Redacted – For Public Inspection version in the above referenced dockets. WCC also submitted supplemental filings of certain Exhibits to its petition on April 6, 2012 and April 12, 2012. After further review, WCC discovered that certain Exhibits requested as confidential should be publicly available. Therefore, WCC now resubmits the public version of its Petition for Waiver, incorporating supplements of public information that were subsequently filed, making clear that the following Exhibits can be made public: Exhibits 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 9, 12, 13, 14 and 15.

Should you have any questions, please contact the undersigned.

11/

Monica S. Desai

PATTON BOGGS LLP

2550 M Street NW

Washington, DC 20037

(202) 457-7535

Counsel For Windy City Cellular, LLC

Pio of Casiss novel Off

BEFORE THE FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION WASHINGTON, D.C. 20554

FILED/ACCEPTED

APR 18 2012

			/ //
In the Matter of)		Federal Communications Commission
Connect America Fund)	WC Docket No. 10-90	Office of the Secretary
A National Broadband Plan for Our Future))	GN Docket No. 09-51	
Establishing Just and Reasonable Rates for Local Exchange Carriers)	WC Docket No. 07-135	
High-Cost Universal Service Support))	WC Docket No. 05-337	
Developing an Unified Intercarrier Compensation Regime)))	CC Docket No. 01-92	
Federal-State Joint Board on Universal Service)))	CC Docket No. 96-45	
Lifeline and Link-Up))	WC Docket No. 03-109	
Universal Service Reform – Mobility Fund)	WT Docket No. 10-208	

To the Wireless Telecommunications Bureau:

PETITION FOR WAIVER OF WINDY CITY CELLULAR, LLC

Larry Mayes, President/CEO Andilea Weaver, Chief Operations Officer WCC Cellular, LLC 1410 Rudakof Circle Anchorage, Alaska 99508 Phone: (907) 222-0844 Monica S. Desai Jennifer L. Richter Maria Wolvin Jennifer Cetta Patton Boggs LLP 2550 M Street, NW Washington, DC 20037 (202) 457-5666

Counsel to Windy City Cellular, LLC

Dated: April 3, 2012

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Universal Service funding has enabled Windy City Cellular, LLC ("WCC") to build a mobile network and provide wireless service on Adak Island in Alaska, one of the most remote and insular areas of the United States. Adak Island is located in an earthquake zone and in the vicinity of an active volcano. The area is mountainous, and is characterized by extreme weather conditions including cyclonic storms, wind gusts in excess of 100 knots, fog storms in the summer, and an average accumulation of more than eight feet of snow.

Taking into consideration all three carriers that provide wireline or wireless voice service in the Adak area, WCC is the only carrier that provides voice service throughout the entire Adak area, including areas that extend into the sea and Aleutian Wilderness where critical services and industries operate. This service has been essential in providing E911 and basic communications services to governmental entities, businesses and the resident population of Adak Island. The entities dependent on WCC service include: The Marine Exchange, which operates on Adak one of the most important vessel tracking receiving sites in Alaska; The Aleut Corporation, which provides fuel to the area and operates other businesses on the island; and the United States Geological Survey ("USGS") Volcano Observatory, which monitors the active volcano on the island. In addition, researchers and subsistence hunters and fisherman rely on WCC service.

The critical service provided by WCC is now in jeopardy. USF funding for WCC was unexpectedly slashed by 84% beginning January 1, 2012, when a \$3,000 annual cap on line support was suddenly implemented six weeks after the *USF/ICC Transformation Order* was issued. If a waiver of the annual cap is not expeditiously granted, the results will be catastrophic for the Adak area: (1) WCC will be forced to cease operating, causing consumers to lose service with no terrestrial alternative, and roaming ability throughout the Adak area will be lost; (2) critical services, government functions, and public safety will be jeopardized; and (3) WCC will

become insolvent, causing the loss of a critical number of jobs for the Adak area. As a result, the cap is having a disproportionate and inequitable impact on WCC. Such consequences are at odds with Commission objectives and do not benefit the public interest.

Moreover, the immediate effective date of the annual cap contradicts one of the Commission's explicit guiding principles from the National Broadband Plan that there should be "no flash cuts" when adopting "Special Access Policies" relating to USF reform. The requested waiver is necessary to ensure that the Administrative Procedures Act and principles of fairness and due process are not violated, and to cure the disproportionate or inequitable impact the cap is already having on WCC.

WCC recognizes the Commission's goal of transitioning from an identical support rule to new recovery mechanisms. WCC has determined that it needs a bare minimum of \$880.09 per line, per month, which is less than half the support it was receiving months ago, in order to cover operating expenses until the transition to Phase II Mobility Funding occurs. WCC is requesting only the amount of support that is necessary given Adak's remote location, volatile climate and extreme weather - not the amount it was previously receiving which it was using to make redundant, expand and improve its service. In summary, WCC requests a time-limited waiver to maintain only the current level of service.

¹ Federal Communications Commission, Omnibus Broadband Initiative, Connecting America: The National Broadband Plan, GN Docket No. 09-51, at 143 (2010) ("National Broadband Plan")(emphasis added)(stating "New rules should be phased in over a reasonable time period. Policymakers must give service providers and investors time to adjust to a new regulatory regime.").

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECU	UTIVE	SUMMARYi
	I.	BACKGROUND ON WCC AND SERVICE TO THE ADAK AREA3
	II.	THE FCC COULD NOT HAVE INTENDED THE RESULT CAUSED BY THE STRICT APPLICATION OF THE ANNUAL CAP FOR THE ADAK AREA7
	III.	GOOD CAUSE EXISTS AND THE PUBLIC INTEREST WILL BE SERVED BY EXEMPTING WCC FROM THE NEW REQUIREMENTS CONTAINED IN SECTION 54.307(e) AND GRANTING THIS WAIVER
		A. Without a Waiver, WCC Customers Will Lose Service With No Terrestrial Alternative and No Roaming Capabilities Outside the Downtown Area
		B. Without a Waiver, Critical Services, Government Functions and Public Safety Will Be Jeopardized
		C. Without a Waiver, WCC will become Insolvent and Critical Jobs In The Adak Area Will Be Lost18
	IV.	GRANTING WCC'S WAIVER REQUEST IS NECESSARY TO ENSURE THAT THE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE ACT AND PRINCIPLES OF FAIRNESS AND DUE PROCESS ARE NOT VIOLATED
		 A. The Proposed Rule Failed to Provide Adequate Notice and Opportunity for Comment Regarding the \$3,000 Cap
		Serving Remote Areas, Such As WCC
	V.	REQUESTED RELIEF23
		A. WCC Is Entitled to Expedited Review
	VI.	CONCLUSION

REDACTED - FOR PUBLIC INSPECTION

ATTACHED EXHIBITS

Letters of Support	Attachment A
Density, Geographic Characteristics Of the Adak Area	Exhibit 1
Information Regarding Lack of Alternative Providers	Exhibit 2
Make-Up of Corporate Operations Expenses	Exhibit 3
Information on End User Rate Plans	Exhibit 4
Maps Showing Service Areas	Exhibit 5
Evidence Demonstrating WCC Is Only Provider of Mobile Service in Significant Portion of Study Area	Exhibit 6
Revenue & Expense Data for Each Cell Site for Three Most Recent Fiscal Years	Exhibit 7
Projected Revenues & Expenses on Cell-Site Basis for Five Years With & Without the Waiver	Exhibit 8
List of Services Other Than Voice Telephone Services Provided Over Universal Service Supported Plan	Exhibit 9
Procedures for Allocating Shared or Common Costs	Exhibit 10
Audited Financial Statements & Notes for Most Recent Three Years	Exhibit 11
Information on Outstanding Loans	Exhibit 12
Identification of Facilities to Be Taken Out of Service Absent Grant of Waiver	Exhibit 13
Additional Information About Operating, Economic, Other Conditions or Reasons Warranting Relief	Exhibit 14
Declarations Under Penalty of Perjury	Exhibit 15

BEFORE THE FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION WASHINGTON, D.C. 20554

In the Matter of)
Connect America Fund) WC Docket No. 10-90
A National Broadband Plan for Our Future) GN Docket No. 09-51
Establishing Just and Reasonable Rates for Local Exchange Carriers) WC Docket No. 07-135
High-Cost Universal Service Support) WC Docket No. 05-337
Developing an Unified Intercarrier Compensation Regime) CC Docket No. 01-92
Federal-State Joint Board on Universal Service) CC Docket No. 96-45
Lifeline and Link-Up) WC Docket No. 03-109
Universal Service Reform – Mobility Fund) WT Docket No. 10-208

To the Wireless Telecommunications Bureau:

PETITION FOR WAIVER OF WINDY CITY CELLULAR, LLC

Windy City Cellular, LLC ("WCC"), pursuant to Section 1.3 of the Commission's Rules, respectfully requests a waiver of Section 54.307(e) of the Universal Service Fund ("USF") and Intercarrier Compensation ("ICC") reform rules adopted by the Commission as part of its *Report and Order* (the "*USF/ICC Transformation Order*") released on November 18, 2011.²
Specifically, WCC requests a waiver of the Commission's sudden implementation of the \$3,000

² See Connect America Fund et al., WC Docket No. 10-90 et al., Report and Order and Further Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, FCC 11-161, 26 FCC Rcd 17663, ¶ 508 (2011) ("USF/ICC Transformation Order"). The Interim Support for Remote Areas in Alaska rule is to be codified at 47 C.F.R. § 54.307(e)(v).

annual cap on interim USF support, which became effective six weeks after the *USF/ICC Transformation Order* was issued. For WCC, a competitive eligible telecommunications carrier ("CETC") serving a remote and insular area in Alaska, the continued enforcement of this cap, which immediately reduced WCC's USF funding by 84%, will have service-ending consequences for WCC and the entire Adak community. Good cause exists to exempt WCC from the new requirements contained in Section 54.307(e) and to grant WCC a limited waiver of the cap until Phase II Mobility Funding is disbursed. The waiver requested by WCC is limited in time and in support level because WCC is only seeking a portion of its prior USF funding – only what is needed to recover operating expenses and the cost of WCC's prior network investments.

WCC is the only wireless carrier that provides voice service to the entirety of the Adak area in the Aleutian Islands, including areas that extend into the sea and Aleutian Wilderness where critical services, public safety and industries operate (the "Adak area"). As explained in further detail in this Petition, if a waiver of the annual cap is not granted, WCC service will shut down within six months, and the results will be disastrous for the Adak area: (1) WCC customers will lose service with no terrestrial alternative and no roaming ability outside the downtown area; (2) critical services, government functions, and public safety will be jeopardized; and (3) WCC will become insolvent causing a loss of a critical number of jobs for the area. All of these results are clearly at odds with the Commission's universal service, wireless and public safety goals, and the Administration's goals with respect to job creation.

Moreover, since Section 54.307(e) was implemented within weeks of the *USF/ICC*Transformation Order's release, without notice of the cap and no ability for WCC to prepare for

³ Although there is another wireless carrier operating in Adak, Alaska Wireless, it only operates one cell site in the downtown area and has a much smaller coverage area than WCC. *See* Exhibit 2.

the change, enforcing the rules is having an immediate "disproportionate or inequitable impact" on WCC. Applying the cap, so suddenly and without notice, violates the Administrative Procedure Act ("APA") and principles of fairness and due process. Furthermore, it contradicts one of the Commission's explicit guiding principles from the National Broadband Plan for adopting "Special Access Policies" relating to USF reform:

<u>No flash cuts</u>. New rules should be phased in over a reasonable time period. Policymakers must give service providers and investors time to adjust to a new regulatory regime.⁵

However, to the Commission's credit, it understood that the national framework created by the *USF/ICC Transformation Order* could be ill-suited to fit individual circumstances, particularly for carriers serving insular areas of Alaska. It therefore wisely provided for an expedited waiver mechanism to deal with such cases speedily. WCC respectfully requests such expeditious decision-making in this case. Without limited relief from the cap within the next six months, WCC will be forced to shut down its wireless operations in Adak, stranding wireless consumers and threatening critical service and public safety in the region.

I. BACKGROUND ON WCC AND SERVICE TO THE ADAK AREA.

Adak Island is an isolated island located approximately 1,200 miles southwest of Anchorage, Alaska, in the Aleutian Chain of islands. It is situated near an active volcano and in an earthquake zone. The Adak area is represented on the first map contained in Exhibit 5. The area is characterized by frequent cyclonic storms, winter squalls producing wind gusts in excess

⁴ See USF/ICC Transformation Order, ¶ 508.

⁵ Federal Communications Commission, Omnibus Broadband Initiative, Connecting America: The National Broadband Plan, GN Docket No. 09-51, at 143 (2010) ("National Broadband Plan")(emphasis added).

 $^{^6}$ See USF/ICC Transformation Order, \P 508.

of 100 knots, extensive fog storms in the summer, and an average accumulated snowfall of 100 inches. Because Adak has a maritime climate with severe storms and high winds during much of the year, it has limited accessibility only by air or by large oceangoing vessels. In the best of circumstances, commercial air service consists of twice-weekly flights and barges arrive only once a year. Adak is undoubtedly one of the most remote, isolated, and climactically inhospitable communities in the United States. Outside of the downtown area, people travel long distances between points and are dependent on wireless communications for safety, particularly due to severe weather.

The Adak service area covers approximately 61,000 acres and consists of that portion of Adak Island that was formerly a United States Naval Complex (roughly, the northern one-half of the island). In 2004, The Aleut Corporation, one of 13 Alaska Native Regional Corporations created under the Alaska Native Claims Settlement Act of 1971 in settlement of aboriginal land claims, purchased Adak land and facilities under a land transfer agreement with the Department of the Interior and the U.S. Navy/Department of Defense. The area includes one of the most important vessel tracking receiving sites in Alaska, and is part of a vessel tracking network to aid safe, secure, efficient and environmentally sound maritime operations in Alaska. Much of Adak Island is part of the Alaska Maritime National Wildlife Refuge. Based on the most recent United States census data of 2010, Adak has a total population of 326 (the State of Alaska estimates the population at 331). There is also a large number of contractors in Adak who provide various

⁷ See Density, Geographic Characteristics of Study Area at Exhibit 1; see also Letter from City Manager of Adak dated March 27, 2012 ("City of Adak Letter") at Attachment A.

⁸ See Letter from Marine Exchange of Alaska dated March 28, 2012 ("Marine Exchange Letter") at Attachment A.

critical and governmental services relating to maritime safety, ordinance disposal, environmental remediation, asset evaluation, wildlife preservation, and environmental monitoring.

WCC's wireline affiliate, Adak Eagle Enterprises ("AEE") rebuilt the Island's telecommunications system after it assumed operation of Adak's telephone service. At the time, the telephone plant, which was installed by the military over the course of several decades, was degraded, outdated, and inadequate for long term, reliable provision of regulated local exchange service to customers. As noted by The Aleut Corporation in a letter that is attached hereto in Attachment A, three mid-size and larger telecommunications carriers were also asked to provide service to Adak in 2003, but all declined. Instead, AEE took on this role when no other carrier was willing to do so, and now provides modern local exchange, broadband, and Internet services in the Adak area through a digital fiber-optic network. All of the personnel that operate WCC's wireless service also work for AEE to provide wireline service to the Adak area. Both AEE and WCC have unmatched knowledge of the local and transient population's needs and are proud to provide quality communications services to Adak. AEE also will be filling a waiver request with respect to the USF/ICC Transformation Order in the coming weeks. Without a waiver, AEE will be forced to shut down operations within twelve months.

WCC was certified as an ETC by the Regulatory Commission of Alaska ("RCA") in December 2008. As part of its certification, RCA determined that designating WCC as an ETC served the public interest because, among other reasons, WCC would be able to improve public safety and provide much needed mobile service to underserved and unserved areas in the remote

⁹ See Letter from The Aleut Corporation dated March 28, 2012 ("TAC Letter") at Attachment A.

Adak area. ¹⁰ In 2009, WCC launched wireless service on Adak Island through its Downtown Cell Site. Just last year, WCC completed the construction of the White Alice Cell Site which expanded the coverage area toward the harbor and beyond for incoming sea vessels – which has been critical for the Marine Exchange of Alaska, and maritime safety and emergency response. ¹¹ The White Alice Cell site also provides coverage for the far side of the Adak Island for environmental researchers and contractors where coverage was previously blocked by mountains. For 2012, WCC had planned to construct the Clam Lagoon Cell Site, projected to cost \$1 million, to enable network redundancy and prevent service interruptions that would otherwise occur if another cell site experienced operational problems, a result that often occurs because of the severe weather in the Adak area. However, in the wake of the *USF/ICC Transformation Order* and its devastating financial impact on WCC, construction was halted.

Since commencing operations on Adak Island, WCC has made substantial investments to support and grow its network and service offerings so that Adak residents and visitors can have increased access to a comprehensive and reliable mobile service, despite Adak's remote location. As a result, WCC is the only wireless carrier that offers wireless service throughout the entire Adak area, including the sea and Aleutian Wilderness. WCC's coverage serves a vital

¹⁰ Request by WCC Cellular, LLC for Designation as an Eligible Telecommunications Carrier in the Study Area Served by Adak Eagle Enterprises LLC, d/b/a Adak Telephone Utility, Regulatory Commission of Alaska, U-08-67, ORDER NO.2 (Dec. 3, 2008).

¹¹ See Marine Exchange Letter at Attachment A.

¹² For example, just last year WCC expended funds to enable cellular voice and data traffic backhaul to the outside world, to open a retail location on the Island to help facilitate customer service, to purchase cellular phones and accessories that were broadband capable for texting and accessing the Internet, to expand its handset offerings to provide additional functionality, and to purchase Special Purpose Vehicles that are able to reach the White Alice Site during the repeated snow storms that are a common part of the winter weather on the Island. *See* WCC's 2011 Annual ETC Report dated March 30, 2012 at Exhibit 14.

role because it includes areas where no other wireline or wireless alternative exists. The wireless service is particularly vital given the distances between points outside downtown and the severe and unpredictable weather conditions. Thus, if WCC were forced to cease operations, groups such as the Marine Exchange of Alaska, government researchers working for the USGS Volcano Observatory and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, subsistence fishermen, subsistence hunters, and other members of the public that venture outside the downtown area or into any areas without a landline option, would be left without any access to voice services and without any ability to communicate, particularly in times of emergency.

II. THE FCC COULD NOT HAVE INTENDED THE RESULT CAUSED BY THE STRICT APPLICATION OF THE ANNUAL CAP FOR THE ADAK AREA.

As reflected above, WCC is committed to providing reliable, comprehensive coverage to the populations, industries and critical government services, including public safety, that reside in Adak, but changes in the funding structure mandated by the *USF/ICC Transformation Order* will make it impossible for WCC to continue. While there are several reforms in *the USF/ICC Transformation Order* that cause WCC concern, the most immediate and catastrophic change is that CETCs are now capped annually at \$3,000 per line (equating to \$250 per line, per month). This cap explicitly applies to CETCs that are serving remote areas in Alaska:

Interim Support for Remote Areas in Alaska. From January 1, 2012, until December 31, 2013, competitive eligible telecommunications carriers subject to the delayed phase down for remote areas in Alaska shall receive the support, as calculated by the Administrator, each competitive eligible telecommunications carrier would have received under the frozen per-line support amount as of December 31, 2011 capped at \$3,000 per year, provided that the total amount of support for all such competitive eligible telecommunications carriers shall be capped pursuant to subparagraph (A).

¹³ See USF/ICC Transformation Order, Final Rule to be codified at 47 C.F.R. § 54.307(e)(v); see also n. 880.

Because the Commission did not provide for a delay or gradual transition in implementing the cap, WCC's disbursement declined in January by 84 percent (from \$136,344 in December 2011 to \$22,356 in January 2012). WCC understands that Adak may be the only community in the United States affected by the cap in this unexpected way. WCC recognizes the Commission's desire to phase down current high-cost funding in order to transition to the Mobility Fund programs, but believes the Commission could not have intended for the annual cap to impose such an immediate, drastic cut on a carrier like WCC.

First, the Commission noted that "[t]here is no indication in the record ... that competitive ETCs need support in excess of \$3,000 per line [per year] to maintain existing service pending transition to the Mobility Fund." However, WCC has been receiving, on average \$1,363 per line, per month to provide wireless service to the people of Adak Island. This substantially higher cost is based on factors that the Commission recognized justifies a flexible approach "to take into account the unique conditions in places like Alaska," such as "remoteness, lack of roads, challenges and costs associated with transporting fuel, lack of scalability per community, satellite and backhaul availability, extreme weather conditions, challenging topography, and short construction season." All of these factors are applicable to Adak. The area is so remote that residents must ship in groceries from Anchorage, which is 1,200 miles away. There are only 16 miles of paved roads in the area – and to reach the cell sites WCC must travel primarily on unpaved, steep, slick and treacherous terrain. It is challenging and expensive to ship in fuel and equipment – a barge arrives once a year, and

¹⁴ Id., ¶ 516.

¹⁵ *Id.*, ¶ 508.

¹⁶ As a point of reference, at the Adak General Store: a ½ gallon of milk costs \$7.99; 16 ounce canned goods are \$4-7 per can; and a gallon of water costs \$15.99.

airplane service is twice per week at best. The area is mountainous, covered in snow for the greater part of the year, covered in fog for much of the summer, has gale winds in all months of the year, and is characterized by extreme and sudden changes in weather.¹⁷

Second, the Commission decided to use a full year of funding to best approximate a carrier's baseline to serve as "a natural starting point for the phase-down of support." Under no circumstances, however, could a baseline which reflects an 84% reduction in funding be considered "a natural starting point" or "a reasonable approximation of the amount that competitive ETCs would currently expect to receive."

In addition, the Commission wisely recognized that the unique challenges of serving remote parts of Alaska justify adopting a two-year delay in the phase down of support for such carriers. However, when devising the flash cut annual cap, the Commission failed to appreciate that the very same set of factors that justified a delay in the phase down, are the same ones that necessitate a delay for applying the annual cap to a provider like WCC:

We find persuasive, however, arguments that carriers serving remote parts of Alaska, including Alaska Native villages, should have a slower transition path in order to preserve newly initiated services and facilitate additional investment in still unserved and underserved areas during the national transition to the Mobility Funds. Over 50 remote communities in Alaska have no access to mobile voice service today, and many remote Alaskan communities have access to only 2G services. While carriers serving other parts of Alaska will be subject to the national five-year transition period, we are convinced a more gradual approach is warranted for carriers in remote parts of Alaska. Specifically, in lifting the Covered Locations exception, we delay the beginning of the five-year transition period for a two-year period for remote areas of Alaska. As a result, we expect that ongoing support through the Mobility Fund Phase II, including the Tribal Mobility Fund Phase II, will be implemented prior to the beginning of the five-

¹⁷ See Density, Geographic Characteristics of Study Area at Exhibit 1.

 $^{^{18}}$ USF/ICC Transformation Order, \P 515.

¹⁹ *Id*.

year transition period in July 2014 for remote parts of Alaska, providing greater certainty and stability for carriers in these areas. During this two-year period, we establish an interim cap for remote areas of Alaska for high-cost support for competitive ETCs, which balances the need to control the growth in support to competitive ETCs in uncapped areas and the need to provide a more gradual transition for the very remote and very high-cost areas in Alaska to reflect the special circumstances carriers and consumers face in those communities.²⁰

The Commission stated that the phase down's gradual transition period "is desirable in order to avoid shocks to service providers that may result in service disruptions for consumers." In WCC's case, the immediate imposition of an 84% reduction in funding before the phase down even begins results in the very kind of shock and service disruption that the Commission attempted to avoid by adopting a delayed, gradual approach for other reforms. Moreover, the immediate effective date of the annual cap contradicts one of the Commission's explicit guiding principles from the National Broadband Plan for adopting "Special Access Policies" relating to USF reform:

<u>No flash cuts</u>. New rules should be phased in over a reasonable time period. Policymakers must give service providers and investors time to adjust to a new regulatory regime.²²

While the Commission adhered to this principle in other reforms adopted by the USF/ICC Transformation Order, it neglected to apply this important feature when making the annual cap effective only six weeks after the release date. In this case, adopting a flash cut annual cap not only deprived WCC of a reasonable time period "to adjust to a new regulatory regime," but it also made it impossible for WCC to obtain a waiver of the annual cap based on its

 $^{^{20}}$ Id., ¶ 529.

²¹ *Id*., ¶ 513.

²² Federal Communications Commission, Omnibus Broadband Initiative, Connecting America: The National Broadband Plan, GN Docket No. 09-51, at 143 (2010) ("National Broadband Plan") (emphasis added).

unique circumstances before it was harmed (beginning in January) by the flash cut change in support.

Furthermore, as the Commission correctly points out, its "statutory obligation runs to consumers" and that it "must target limited public funds in a way that expands and sustains the availability of mobile broadband services to maximize consumer benefits."²³

In this instance, however, if the annual cap is applied to WCC, the public will lose the benefit of the existing comprehensive and reliable WCC wireless access which enables mobile broadband and covers the entire Adak area. Because WCC is the only carrier capable of providing this expanded coverage, if it goes out of business because of the annual cap, the Commission will be responsible for creating new unserved areas in Alaska. Such a result runs directly counter to the Commission's statutory responsibility and stated goal of ensuring consumers receive supported services.²⁴

To stay true to the goal of "a more gradual transition for the very remote and very highcost areas in Alaska to reflect the special circumstances carriers and consumers face in those

USF/ICC Transformation Order, ¶ 1136. See also id. (identifying "Maximize broadband availability" as a guiding principle for adopting special access policies related to USF reform, noting that "[t]he objective should be to maximize the number of households that are served by broadband meeting the National Broadband Availability Target."); see also Inquiry Concerning the Deployment of Advanced Telecommunications Capability to All Americans in a Reasonable and Timely Fashion, and Possible Steps to Accelerate Such Deployment Pursuant to Section 706 of the Telecommunications Act of 1996, as Amended by the Broadband Data Improvement Act; A National Broadband Plan for Our Future, GN Docket Nos. 09-51, 09-137, Sixth Broadband Deployment Report, FCC 10-129,¶ 29 (2010)(stating "[t]he goal of the statute, and the standard against which we measure our progress, is universal broadband availability."); see also FCC Creates 'Connect America Fund' To Help Extend High-Speed Internet To 18 Million Unserved Americans; Creating Jobs & Increased Consumer Benefits, News Release (Oct. 27, 2011)(stating "the FCC recognizes the growing importance of mobile broadband" making "it an independent universal service objective for the first time in history.").

²⁴ See USF/ICC Transformation Order, \P 222.

communities," the Wireless Telecommunications Bureau (the "Bureau") should act expeditiously to correct the ongoing harm to WCC and grant this waiver request.

III. GOOD CAUSE EXISTS AND THE PUBLIC INTEREST WILL BE SERVED BY EXEMPTING WCC FROM THE NEW REQUIREMENTS CONTAINED IN SECTION 54.307(e) AND GRANTING THIS WAIVER.

Application of the \$3,000 annual cap to WCC is causing devastating consequences that will quickly undo the tremendous progress that has been made to ensure that Adak Island has a comprehensive and reliable wireless network. Unlike other CETCs in the nation that may have the option of engaging in some belt-tightening measures under the cap while the transition to Mobility Funds is pending, WCC will have no choice but to shut down all operations due to the insurmountable operating costs caused by Adak's remote area and harsh weather conditions. As a result, if a waiver is not granted: (1) WCC customers will lose service with no terrestrial alternative and roaming ability outside the downtown area; (2) critical services, government functions and public safety will be jeopardized; and (3) WCC will become insolvent, causing the loss of a critical number of jobs for the Adak area.

If the waiver is granted, however, WCC will continue to provide much needed service to this remote area in Alaska, thereby ensuring consumers retain access to service and roaming capabilities, and critical services and public safety functions will be maintained without disruption. This result is consistent with the stated objectives of the *USF/ICC Transformation Order*, promotes the public interest, and is justified by the good cause standard.

²⁵ See id., ¶ 1136.

A. Without a Waiver, WCC Customers Will Lose Service With No Terrestrial Alternative and No Roaming Capabilities Outside the Downtown Area.

While it may be true for the rest of the country that "phasing down and transitioning existing competitive support will not create significant or widespread risks that consumers in areas that currently have service, including mobile service, will be left without any viable mobile service provider serving their area," in the case of WCC, the immediate 84% reduction in funding based on the annual cap is expected to put WCC out of business within the next six months. Because WCC is the only CETC capable of providing voice service throughout the entire Adak area, including the sea and the Aleutian Wilderness, this result clearly "put[s] consumers at risk of losing voice service, with no alternative terrestrial providers available" to provide full coverage. See Map at Exhibit 2. This is the precise situation that the Commission had in mind when describing the waiver mechanism in its USF/ICC Transformation Order. 28

Although there is one other wireless carrier operating in the Adak area, Alaska Wireless, its coverage area, limited to downtown, is significantly smaller than WCC's service area. See Map at Exhibit 2. Although Alaska Wireless had plans to launch a second cell site to expand its coverage and provide the redundancy needed to increase reliability, it never did so. However, with two fully operational cell sites to provide complete coverage to the area as well as some redundancy needed to ensure reliable access throughout the entire Adak area, WCC reaches all households in Adak as well as critical locations at sea and in the Aleutian Wilderness. Wireless

 $^{^{26}}$ Id., \P 522.

²⁷ *Id.*, ¶ 32.

²⁸ See id.

access in these more remote locations is particularly vital because there is no alternative that has the capability to replace WCC's service.²⁹

As Exhibit 2 demonstrates, if WCC's service shuts down, there will be no wireless service outside the Alaska Wireless coverage area in downtown Adak. WCC's coverage area is twice as large as the coverage provided by Alaska Wireless. Without WCC service, consumers could either subscribe to Alaska Wireless in the downtown area, or subscribe to the wireline solutions offered by AEE. However, as the map indicates, even the AEE coverage area is not as large as the WCC coverage area. Consequently, without WCC, some customers will be completely without terrestrial voice alternatives (either wireline or wireless). Other customers will be able to switch to Alaska Wireless or to wireline service through AEE (if AEE is able to obtain a waiver and continue providing service). Those customers that choose Alaska Wireless service in downtown will not be able to roam throughout the Adak area if WCC goes out of business.

Given the number of contractors and seasonal workers that come to Adak, principally in the remote areas, roaming ability is crucial to ensure voice access to places where no wireline service is available. The Commission specifically stated in the *USF/ICC Transformation Order* that it would "consider as a factor showings regarding the impact on customers, including roaming customers, if a petitioner is the only provider of CDMA or GSM coverage in the affected area" when evaluating waiver requests. WCC is the only provider of wireless services outside the downtown area. Thus, if WCC service shuts down, Alaska Wireless and AT&T

²⁹ Moreover, if AEE is also forced to shut down operations, coverage to Adak will be available only to the downtown area, leaving entities such as the Marine Exchange of Alaska and the USGS Volcano Observatory without wireless coverage and phone service.

³⁰ USF/ICC Transformation Order, ¶ 540.

customers that visit Adak (AT&T has a roaming agreement with WCC) will not be able to roam in Adak outside the downtown area, and this includes critical services and public safety that operate solely in the more remote areas. Moreover, if AEE is not granted a waiver of the USF/ICC Transformation Order's requirements so that it can continue providing service, the only voice alternative that will be left in Adak will be the Alaska Wireless service which is limited to downtown. Here, the loss of roaming ability in one of the most severe and climactically volatile areas of the United States would be catastrophic.

The loss of service due to the immediate application of the annual cap, both to current customers in remote areas and other consumers who rely on roaming availability, runs directly counter to the Commission's goal of ensuring telecommunications access available to all. A waiver is necessary and should be granted promptly.

B. Without a Waiver, Critical Services, Government Functions and Public Safety Will Be Jeopardized.

In addition to providing the public with essential, life-preserving access to emergency responders, WCC is the only provider of wireless services to critical infrastructure, government functions and public safety entities in the Adak area. Letters from several of these entities, including The Marine Exchange, The Aleut Corporation, and the City of Adak, are attached at Attachment A. As explained by The Aleut Corporation, an Alaska Native Regional Corporation whose shareholders are primarily of Aleut descent, without a waiver the entire Adak area will be in jeopardy:

Without a waiver, the consequences of the FCC Order on AEE and WCC will be felt by nearly the entire island of Adak, including TAC [The Aleut Corporation] and its subsidiaries [which provide fuel to the area], and critical government entities including the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, The City of Adak, the Marine Exchange (which is responsible for monitoring fishing vessels in the Bering Sea and the Pacific Ocean), the USGS Albuquerque Seismological Laboratory, and the Alaska Volcano Observatory, as well as government

contractors, tourists, hunters and fisherman. The overall safety, growth and economic development of this remote island will be jeopardized.³¹

Last year, WCC completed the construction of the White Alice Cell Site which expanded its wireless coverage area toward the harbor and beyond for incoming sea vessels. Deployment of this site was critical for the Marine Exchange of Alaska, maritime safety and emergency response. The White Alice Cell site also provides coverage for the far side of the Adak Island for environmental researchers and contractors where coverage was previously blocked by mountains. The Marine Exchange of Alaska and Captain Edward E. Page of the U.S. Coast Guard (Retired), offers a helpful perspective on the critical nature of WCC's services for maritime safety:

The Marine Exchange of Alaska . . . has developed a comprehensive vessel tracking network throughout Alaska to aid safe, secure, efficient and environmentally sound maritime operations. One of our most important vessel tracking AIS (Automatic Identification System) receiving sites in Alaska is located in Adak on the White Alice location. This tracking system is relied on by the Coast Guard, State of Alaska and the maritime community to aid maritime safety and emergency response. The operation of this vessel tracking . . . is very dependent on the power and internet connectivity that AEE and Windy City provide. If the FCC Transformation Order is not reversed for Adak, the future of this vessel tracking system is in jeopardy as is the future of the community itself which certainly is not in the best interests of our country. ³³

The City of Adak also has weighed in about the need for WCC's service and expertise with respect to an E-911 system for the Adak area.

With the recent arrival of Icicle Seafoods in the community, as well as recognizing other opportunities that have begun to materialize on Adak Island, the City has acknowledged that its 911 system needs to be severely improved . . . The City has reached a point where the existing 911 system has been fully maximized and is not capable of further expansion. To the extent practical, we have sought

³¹ TAC Letter at Attachment A.

³² See Marine Exchange Letter at Attachment A.

 $^{^{33}}$ Id.

to integrate WCC's cellular network in order to provide for E-911 services, however the City lacks the institutional knowledge of newer 911 systems . . . [911 service] is essential, especially as we are inside of an extremely active volcanic, earthquake and severe weather zone. Due to the severity, there are times the City cannot monitor certain areas of town or its facilities. We have sought to utilize the WCC network to start utilizing remote monitoring, yet efforts to stymie the operations of [AEE and WCC] threatens to undermine the city's ability to efficiently deploy staff and resources.³⁴

In addition to The Aleut Corporation, the Marine Exchange, and the City of Adak, WCC provides essential wireless services to the Coast Guard, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, and the USGS Albuquerque Seismological Laboratory which are engaged in environmental remediation, wildlife preservation, and public safety. WCC also provides wireless service to the following:

- The Alaska Volcano Observatory (AVO), which is a joint program of the USGS, the Geophysical Institute of the University of Alaska Fairbanks (UAFGI), and the State of Alaska Division of Geological and Geophysical Surveys (ADGGS). AVO uses federal, state, and university resources to monitor and study Alaska's hazardous volcanoes, to predict and record eruptive activity, and to mitigate volcanic hazards to life and property by providing timely and accurate information on volcanic hazards, and warnings of impending dangerous activity, to local, state, and federal officials and the public.
- The TAC fueling port and crew transfer facility for foreign fishing fleets.
- Icicle Seafood, which runs and operates the fish processing on the island, a primary employer and economic source for the Adak area.
- Alaska Airlines

If WCC is not granted a waiver, the consequences for the foregoing critical services, industries, governmental entities, public safety resources and industrial enterprises in the Adak area will be devastating.³⁵

Equally serious are the public safety consequences for residents of Adak if WCC service is shut down. WCC is the sole provider of wireless services beyond the downtown Adak area,

³⁴ City of Adak Letter at Attachment A.

³⁵ See id.

including the sea and the wilderness where subsistence hunting and fishing primarily occurs. Currently, WCC subscribers in these remote areas can access emergency services by dialing 911 on their handset. The emergency call is routed through WCC's soft switch to the local Public Safety Answering Point ("PSAP") on Adak Island. However, if WCC is no longer able to provide wireless service, no voice service, including emergency calls, will be possible from these locations. In rural Alaska, the connection to emergency services can be the difference between life and death.

WCC is a model example for how USF support has been used to successfully turn a remote island with no hope of mobile access, into an area where essential, life-preserving access to wireless service is possible, whether downtown, in the wilderness, or out at sea. The wireless access provided by WCC is the underpinning for important public safety functions, research endeavors, jobs, and day-to-day living for the Adak area. For all of these reasons, good cause exists for the Bureau to grant this waiver request.

C. Without a Waiver, WCC will become Insolvent and Critical Jobs In The Adak Area Will Be Lost.

The Commission specifically stated in the *USF/ICC Transformation Order* that it would consider whether its reforms would cause a carrier to become insolvent when determining the necessity for a waiver.³⁶ Without a waiver of the annual cap, WCC predicts it will run out of money within six months and will, therefore, be unable to continue providing service.

If WCC becomes insolvent, not only will its wireless service cease, but the wireline service provided by WCC's affiliate, AEE, will suffer. WCC and AEE each rely on the same small staff, which is shared between the companies. If WCC is forced to go out of business, AEE will not be able to afford the full cost of keeping shared employees. AEE will have no

 $^{^{36}}$ USF/ICC Transformation Order, \P 540.

choice but to cut its already lean workforce of 13 employees down to 8 employees – a 1/3 reduction in workforce. As the City of Adak noted in its letter of support:

We expect that [WCC and AEE] would collectively be driven into bankruptcy within 12 months, impacting the Rural Utilities Service ("RUS") fund by forcing default on loans extended to AEE. Furthermore, at least six (6) people on Adak Island, compris[ed] of highly skilled individuals, will be terminated which will result in a significant hit to the local economy. This community can ill afford another setback to community development and sustainability.³⁷

Clearly, the consequences of applying the cap to WCC, without a waiver, are far reaching for the Adak area, and good cause exists for the Bureau to expeditiously grant this waiver request.

IV. GRANTING WCC'S WAIVER REQUEST IS NECESSARY TO ENSURE THAT THE ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE ACT AND PRINCIPLES OF FAIRNESS AND DUE PROCESS ARE NOT VIOLATED.

The Commission created an expedited waiver program to address situations where "specific proposals have a <u>disproportionate or inequitable impact</u> on any carriers (wireline or wireless) serving Alaska."³⁸ As previously explained, granting WCC's waiver request will avoid the demise of WCC and loss of vital communications services to consumers in the Adak area. Moreover, as discussed below, granting WCC's waiver request is also necessary to ensure that the Administrative Procedure Act (APA) and principles of fairness and due process are not violated.

A. The Proposed Rule Failed to Provide Adequate Notice and Opportunity for Comment Regarding the \$3,000 Cap.

Under the APA, an agency may make changes in its proposed rules, but only where such changes are a "logical outgrowth" of the proposal. "In order for a final rule to be a 'logical outgrowth' of a proposal, however, the agency must have provided proper notice of the proposal.

³⁷ See City of Adak letter at Attachment A.

³⁸ USF/ICC Transformation Order, ¶ 508 (emphasis added).